

# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location: Morlan, GA Accident Number: ATL04FA045

Date & Time: 12/04/2003, 1940 EST Registration: N85BK

Aircraft: Beech B200 Aircraft Damage: Destroyed

Defining Event: Injuries: 2 Fatal

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Positioning

## **Analysis**

Upon arriving at the destination airport, the controller cleared the flight for localizer 32 approach and informed the pilot that radar service was terminated and a frequency change was approved, report canceling IFR this frequency. The pilot acknowledged the clearance. A review of radar data revealed that the airplane was on course and lined up with the runway when the airplane collided with trees and the ground one mile south of runway 32. A review of information on file with Southeastern Air Charter, Inc., the operator of the accident airplane, found that the pilot's most recent Airman Competency/Proficiency Check was conducted in a Cessna 210. There were no records to indicate the pilot had under gone a flight-check in the Beech 200, as outlined in the Corporations FAA Approved Operational Specifications. Examination of the airframe and engines found no pre-existing discrepancies that would have precluded the airplane from operating properly prior to impact. Surface Weather Observations reported near the time of the accident. was visibility 1 to 1½ miles; ceiling 200 feet overcast. A review of the approach plate found the minimum descent altitude for the approach to be 325 AGL and visibility 1 mile.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's inadequate in-flight planning/decision when he continued the flight below the decision height and collided with trees. A related factor was the low ceiling.

### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: APPROACH

#### **Findings**

- 1. (F) WEATHER CONDITION LOW CEILING
- 2. (C) IN-FLIGHT PLANNING/DECISION INADEQUATE PILOT IN COMMAND
- 3. (C) ALTITUDE/CLEARANCE NOT MAINTAINED PILOT IN COMMAND 4. (C) DECISION HEIGHT CONTINUED BELOW PILOT IN COMMAND
- 5. OBJECT TREE(S)

Page 2 of 9 ATL04FA045

#### **Factual Information**

#### HISTORY OF FLIGHT

On December 4, 2003, at 1940 eastern standard time, a Beech B200 King Air, N85BK, registered to Eagle Air Holding LLC, Wilmington, Delaware, and operated by Southeastern Air Charter, Inc, collided with trees and subsequently the ground and burst into flames while on a localizer approach to runway 32, at the Newnan Coweta County Airport, near Morlan, Georgia. The repositioning flight was being operated under the provisions of Title 14 CFR Part 91, and instrument flight rules (IFR). Instrument Meteorological conditions prevailed and an IFR flight plan was filed. The commercially rated pilot and co-pilot received fatal injuries and the airplane substantial damage and there was post-crash fire. The flight originated in Douglas, Georgia on December 4, 2003, at 1915.

According to the Director of Maintenance the airplane was returning from a Part 135, ondemand Air Taxi flight to Douglas, Georgia where they had dropped off several passengers. The purpose of this flight was to return the airplane to its base of operations. The Director of Maintenance stated that the reason the ATP rated pilot was in the right seat was that about a week prior to this flight the Pilot had an accident and had severed several fingers from his right hand. The ATP Pilot had undergone surgery to have them reattached and was experiencing some difficulty in operating the airplane's engine and propeller controls from the left seat.

A partial review of communications between Atlanta Air Traffic Control Tower (ATCT), and the pilot revealed that he contacted the controller and stated that he was level at 5,000 feet and that he had the weather at Newnan; Coweta County Airport, and was requesting a lower altitude. The controller acknowledged the pilot's transmission and authorized a descent to 3,000 feet. The pilot acknowledged the transmission and began his descent. The controller asked the pilot if he would like an approach and the pilot acknowledged that he would like the localizer 32 for Newnan. The controller cleared the pilot for Localizer 32 at Newnan and informed him that radar service was terminated and a frequency change was approved, report canceling IFR this frequency. The pilot acknowledged the clearance. A review of radar data revealed that the airplane was on course and lined up with the runway when the accident occurred.

Witnesses at the Newnan-Coweta Airport stated that they heard the pilot of N85BK, announce over the Unicom frequency that they were 10 miles out and on approach to runway 32. The witnesses stated that they looked at the weather computer and saw that the ceiling was down to 150 to 200 feet and they were wondering, "who was attempting to land at that time". They said they never heard any other radio calls from the accident airplane. The airplane crashed near the airport, and residents in the local area telephoned the 911-operator and reported an airplane crash. The airplane wreckage was located one mile south of runway 32, in a densely wooded area.

#### PERSONNEL INFORMATION

A review of information on file with the Federal Aviation Administration Airman's Certification Division, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma, revealed the pilot was issued a commercial pilot certificate with ratings for airplane single engine land, multi-engine land, and instrument airplane. The pilot was issued a flight instructor certificate on October 22, 2001, for airplane single engine land and instrument airplane. A review of records on file with the FAA Aero

Page 3 of 9 ATL04FA045

Medical Records revealed the pilot was issued a first class medical certificate on August 27, 2001, with the restriction that he wear corrective lenses. The pilot reported on his application for the medical certificate that he had accumulated 1,488 total flight hours.

A review of information on file with Southeastern Air Charter, Inc., found that the pilot's most recent Airman Competency/Proficiency Check was conducted on January 11, 2003, in a Cessna 210. The pilot was signed off by the Corporations President/Check Airman. There were no records found nor did any of the Company's Officials recall the pilot having any other check rides since the last one recorded including instrument currency. Additionally, there were no records to show the commercial pilot had under gone a flight-check in the accident airplane as outlined in the Corporations FAA Approved Operational Specifications.

A review of information on file with the Federal Aviation Administration Airman's Certification Division, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma, revealed the co-pilot was issued a Commercial pilot certificate with ratings for airplane single engine land, and a Airline Transport pilot certificate with ratings for airplane multi-engine land. Additionally, the Co-Pilot was type rated in the A-300, DC-9, B727, B757, and the B767 Transport Category Airplanes. He was Certificated as a Flight Instructor in Airplane Single and Multiengine land and Instrument airplanes. The Co-Pilot was also certificated as a Airframe and Powerplant Mechanic, and was Certified as a Flight Engineer in Turbojet Powered and Turbo Propeller Aircraft. A review of records on file with the FAA Aero Medical Records revealed the co-pilot was issued a second class medical certificate on March 29, 2003, with no restrictions. The co-pilot reported on his application for the medical certificate that he had accumulated 2,100 total flight hours. Additionally, the Co-pilot was the President of Southeastern Air Charter, Inc., and was Designated by the FAA as the Company's Check Airmen.

For this flight the ATP rated pilot, enlisted the help from one of his employees who was a Commercial Pilot but had not been checked out in accordance with Southeastern Air Charters FAA Approved Operations Specifications, in the airplane and was not current in instrument flying, to fly in the left seat to operated the controls. A review of Title 14 CFR Part 61.53 (a) Prohibition on operations during medical deficiency states in part that "Operations that require a medical certificate except as provided for in paragraph (b) of this section, a person who holds a current medical certificate issued under part 67 of this chapter shall not act as pilot in command, or in any other capacity as a required pilot flight crewmember, while that person: (1) Knows or has reason to know of any medical condition that would make the person unable to meet the requirements for the medical certificate necessary for the pilot operation." In addition, the Commercial Pilot was listed as the pilot-in-command of record for this flight on the IFR Flight Plan filed with the FAA.

#### AIRCRAFT INFORMATION

A review of maintenance records revealed that the airplane was on a Continuous Airworthiness Inspection Program. The most recent phase inspection occurred on July 2002. At the time of the accident the airplane had accumulated a total time of 9,864 hours, and 183.8 since that last inspection.

#### METEOROLOGICAL INFORMATION

Surface Weather Observations reported near the time of the accident. Newnan Coweta County Airport, Newnan, Georgia (KCCO)

December 4, 2003, 1859 AUTO ... Winds 070 degrees at 4 knots; visibility 1 1/4 miles; ceiling

Page 4 of 9 ATL04FA045

200 feet overcast; temperature 2 degrees C; dew point 2 degrees C; altimeter setting 30.12 inches of Hg.

December 4, 2003, 1920 AUTO ... Winds 060 degrees at 3 knots; visibility 1 mile; ceiling 200 feet overcast; temperature 2 degrees C; dew point 2 degrees C; altimeter setting 30.12 inches of Hg.

Falcon Field, Atlanta, Georgia (KFFC) is about 10 nautical miles east-northeast of Newnan Coweta County Airport, Newnan, Georgia.

December 4, 2003, 1853 AUTO ... Winds variable at 3 knots; visibility 1 ½ miles; mist; ceiling 200 feet overcast; temperature 2 degrees C; dew point 2 degrees C; altimeter setting 30.12 inches of Hg.

December 4, 2003, 1953 AUTO ... Winds variable at 3 knots; visibility 1 ½ miles; mist; ceiling 200 feet overcast; temperature 2 degrees C; dew point 2 degrees C; altimeter setting 30.12 inches of Hg.

#### WRECKAGE AND IMPACT INFORMATION

The wreckage was located in a heavily wooded area about one-mile south of the Coweta County Airport. Examination of the accident site revealed a 350-foot debris path along a 320-degree magnetic heading. The debris path revealed fallen trees and tree limbs along with airplane components. Several tree limbs were found along the debris path that exhibited angular cuts. Some of the angular cuts had a black paint transfer in the grain of the wood.

The main wreckage consisted of the fuselage, both engines, the right propeller, both inboard portions of the wings, and pieces of the left propeller. Fire damage was inside of the cabin and the cockpit, and no instrument or radio indications were obtained. The fuselage rested on a heading of 320-degrees magnetic in line with the approach end of runway 32. Flight control cable connection was confirmed to the empennage and at the cockpit flight controls.

Examination of the left wing found it in three large pieces. The outboard 9-feet of the wing was found with the aileron, red navigation light and strobe still attached The middle portion of the left wing was 8-feet in length and had separated just outboard of the engine nacelle and was fire damaged. The inboard portion of the left wing with the nacelle, separated from the airplane at its root rib. The left main landing gear remained attached to the wing and was found in the retracted position.

The right wing was found in two large pieces. The outboard portion of the wing was about 11-feet in length and six-feet inboard from the tip the wing was bent aft 90-degrees. The bend was oriented angularly from leading edge to trailing edge outboard to inboard about 15-degrees from the longitudinal axis. The inboard portion of the right wing was approximately 11-feet in length and was fire damaged. The right inboard flap remained attached to the wing, while the outboard flap separated. Control cables were found in the outboard wing section, and continuity to the aileron was confirmed. Examination of the right flap actuator found it was extended.

Examination of the vertical stabilizer and rudder found the stabilizer partially separated from the aft fuselage and deformed in a twisted fashion to the left and aft along its front spar. The left horizontal stabilizer separated 54-inches inboard from the tip. There was a 69-inch inboard section of the left elevator attached to the stabilizer. The outboard section of the elevator was separated from the outboard portion of the stabilizer, and was found along the debris field. The

Page 5 of 9 ATL04FA045

right horizontal stabilizer separated at its attach point, leaving a 24-inch section of the rear spar and lower skin attached to the vertical stabilizer. The right elevator separated from the stabilizer, and was located along the debris field.

Examination of the left engine found that it had sustained impact and fire damage to the external housing. Circumferential rubbing and machining were observed in the compressor turbine, the first stage power turbine guide vane ring, and the first stage power turbine. The compressor first stage shroud, the compressor turbine shroud, and the first stage power turbine shroud displayed circumferential scoring.

Examination of the right engine revealed severe fire damage and light impact damage. Circumferential rubbing and machining were observed in the compressor turbine, the first stage power turbine guide vane ring, and the first stage power turbine. The compressor first stage shroud, the compressor turbine shroud, and the first stage power turbine shroud displayed circumferential scoring.

#### MEDICAL AND PATHOLOGICAL INFORMATION

The Division of Forensic Sciences, Georgia Bureau of Investigation, State of Georgia conducted a postmortem examination of the pilot and co-pilot on December 5, 2003. The reported cause of death for both pilot's was "generalized blunt force trauma in an aircraft crash, and the manner of death was accidental." The Forensic Toxicology Research Section, Federal Aviation Administration, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma performed postmortem toxicology of specimens for the pilot and -copilot. For the Pilot there was Carbon Monoxide detected in the blood but no cyanide detected in the blood or ethanol detected in the vitreous. The drug screen for the pilot found Citalopram, Di-N-Desmethylcitalopram, and N-Desmethylcitalopram detected in the blood, and Citalopram, Di-N-Desmethylcitalopram and N-Desmethylcitalopram detected in the liver. For the Co-pilot, there was no carbon monoxide, cyanide, ethanol, or drugs detected in the blood.

#### ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

A review of the Newnan Coweta County Approach Plate for the Locolizer Approach to Runway 32, found the minimum descent altitude for the approach to be 325 AGL and visibility 1 mile.

The airplane wreckage was released to Kern and Wooley LLP, representing Southeastern Air Charter, Inc.

Page 6 of 9 ATL04FA045

### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Flight Instructor; Commercial	Age:	31, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):		Restraint Used:	Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane Single-engine; Instrument Airplane	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 1 With Waivers/Limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	09/01/2002
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	01/01/2003
Flight Time:	1248 hours (Total, all aircraft)		
Co-Pilot Informatio	n		
Certificate:	Airline Transport; Flight Instructor; Commercial; Flight Engineer	Age:	61, Male
Certificate: Airplane Rating(s):	Instructor; Commercial; Flight	Age: Seat Occupied:	61, Male Right
	Instructor; Commercial; Flight Engineer  Multi-engine Land; Single-engine	•	,
Airplane Rating(s):	Instructor; Commercial; Flight Engineer  Multi-engine Land; Single-engine	Seat Occupied:	Right Seatbelt, Shoulder
Airplane Rating(s):  Other Aircraft Rating(s):	Instructor; Commercial; Flight Engineer  Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied: Restraint Used:	Right Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
Airplane Rating(s):  Other Aircraft Rating(s):  Instrument Rating(s):	Instructor; Commercial; Flight Engineer  Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land  None  Airplane Multi-engine; Airplane	Seat Occupied:  Restraint Used:  Second Pilot Present:	Right Seatbelt, Shoulder harness Yes
Airplane Rating(s):  Other Aircraft Rating(s):  Instrument Rating(s):  Instructor Rating(s):	Instructor; Commercial; Flight Engineer  Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land  None  Airplane Multi-engine; Airplane Single-engine; Instrument Airplane Class 2 Without	Seat Occupied:  Restraint Used:  Second Pilot Present:  Toxicology Performed:	Right  Seatbelt, Shoulder harness  Yes  Yes
Airplane Rating(s):  Other Aircraft Rating(s):  Instrument Rating(s):  Instructor Rating(s):  Medical Certification:	Instructor; Commercial; Flight Engineer  Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land  None  Airplane Multi-engine; Airplane Single-engine; Instrument Airplane Class 2 Without	Seat Occupied:  Restraint Used:  Second Pilot Present:  Toxicology Performed:  Last FAA Medical Exam:	Right  Seatbelt, Shoulder harness  Yes  Yes  03/01/2002

Page 7 of 9 ATL04FA045

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N85BK
Model/Series:	B200	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	BB-734
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	10
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	07/01/2002, Continuous Airworthiness	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	12500 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	183.8 Hours	Engines:	2 Turbo Prop
Airframe Total Time:	9864 Hours as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Pratt & Whitney Canada
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	PT6A-42
Registered Owner:	Eagle Air Holding LLC	Rated Power:	715 hp
Operator:	Southeastern Air Charter	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	On-demand Air Taxi (135)
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	MFJA

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Instrument Conditions	Condition of Light:	Dusk
Observation Facility, Elevation:	FFC, 808 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	30 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1840 EST	Direction from Accident Site:	180°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	2 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 200 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	1
Altimeter Setting:	30.13 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	2°C / 2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	Moderate - Fog		
Departure Point:	Douglas, GA (DQH)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	Newnan, GA (CCO)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	1915 EST	Type of Airspace:	

## **Airport Information**

Airport:	Newnan; Coweta Co (CCO)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	970 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Wet
Runway Used:	32	IFR Approach:	Localizer Only
Runway Length/Width:	5025 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Page 8 of 9 ATL04FA045

#### Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	On-Ground
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 Fatal	Latitude, Longitude:	33.299722, -84.752222

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Butch Wilson	Report Date:	09/13/2005
Additional Participating Persons:	Andrew Turner; Atlanta FSDO; College Park, Brian D Cassidy; Raytheon Aircraft; Wichita, Thomas A Berthe; Pratt & Whitney Canada; O	KS	
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as investigations. Dockets released prior to June Record Management Division at		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available <a href="here">here</a>.

Page 9 of 9 ATL04FA045