

National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location: AUSTELL, GA Accident Number: ATL00FA082

Date & Time: 08/18/2000, 2244 EDT Registration: N8WD

Aircraft: Beech B60 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: Injuries: 1 Fatal

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Personal

Analysis

The pilot had experienced engine problems during a flight and requested maintenance assistance from the local maintenance repair station. Before the maintenance personnel signed off and completed the repairs, the pilot refueled the airplane, and attempted an instrument flight back to the originating airport. While enroute, the pilot reported a low fuel situation, and deviated to a closer airport. During the approach, the airplane lost engine power on both engines, collided with trees, and subsequently the ground, about a half of a mile short of the intended runway. There was no fuel found in the fuel system at the accident site. No mechanical problems were discovered with the airplane during the post-accident examination. This accident was the second time the pilot had exhausted the fuel supply in this airplane.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to preflight plan adequate fuel for the flight that resulted in fuel exhaustion and the subsequent loss of engine power.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(PARTIAL) - NONMECHANICAL

Phase of Operation: APPROACH

Findings

1. (C) FLUID, FUEL - EXHAUSTION

2. (C) PLANNING/DECISION - POOR - PILOT IN COMMAND 3. (F) REFUELING - NOT PERFORMED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Findings

4. (F) OBJECT - TREE(S)

Page 2 of 7 ATL00FA082

Factual Information

HISTORY OF FLIGHT

On August 18, 2000, at 2244 eastern daylight time, a Beech B60, N8WD, collided with trees and the ground during an attempted forced landing at the Fulton County Airport near Austell, Georgia. The personal flight was operated by the pilot under the provisions of Title 14 CFR Part 91 with an instrument flight plan filed. Visual weather conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The airplane received substantial damage, and the private pilot was fatally injured. The personal flight departed Houston, Texas, at 1831 central daylight time.

Reportedly, the pilot had flown to Houston, Texas, earlier in the week and had experienced engine problems with the airplane. The airplane was taken to a local repair facility where efforts were attempted to correct the reported malfunction. After several days in Houston, while waiting for the completion of repairs on his airplane, the pilot refueled N8WD, received a weather briefing, and filed an instrument flight plan. Before departing, the pilot ensured that the fuel tanks were topped with the maximum amount of fuel.

At 1750 the pilot was issued an IFR clearance to Peachtree Dekalb Airport in Chamblee, Georgia. He departed Houston at 1831. The pilot reported having low fuel to the Columbus Approach Control at 2123. Columbus Approach coordinated that N8WD was inbound to Peachtree low on fuel with Atlanta Approach. Atlanta Approach advised Columbus, the pilot might want to consider an alternate airport. After a handoff to Atlanta approach, the pilot was advised there was no weather between his position and the destination airport. The pilot reported having approximately 30 minutes of fuel remaining in the fuel tanks. The pilot asked about alternate airports with more than 6,000 feet of runway, and Atlanta Approach suggested Fulton County Airport. At 2128, the pilot informed Atlanta Approach that he would divert to Fulton County Airport.

Atlanta Approach cleared N8WD to 4,000 feet for a vector to Fulton County Airport. At 2130, Atlanta Approach Control advised Fulton County Tower that N8WD was 35 miles southwest and was low on fuel. Nine minutes later, the flight was approximately 10 miles southwest of the airport. N8WD contacted Fulton County Tower at 2140, and was cleared to land on runway 08. While on final approach to runway 08, the pilot reported the loss of engine power on one engine. The Tower noticed N8WD was low on final and asked if the runway was in sight. At this time, the pilot explained that both engines had shut down, and he may not be able to make the runway. At 2144, Fulton County Tower Advised Atlanta Approach Control that N8WD had crashed.

The airplane collided with trees and the ground about one-half mile short of the runway.

PERSONNEL INFORMATION

The pilot held a private pilot certificate with airplane single and multi-engine land, and instrument ratings. His total flight time was 1800 hours and the approximately flying time in the Beech B60 was not determined. The pilot held a current third class medical certificate, dated March 3, 2000, valid when wearing corrective lens.

AIRCRAFT INFORMATION

The Beech B60, N8WD, was owned by XJ6 Inc. of Tucker, Georgia, and operated by Mohammad W. Katoot, of Roswell, Georgia. N8WD was a low-wing airplane powered by two

Page 3 of 7 ATL00FA082

Lycoming TIO-541-E1C4 engines. A review of the airplane maintenance logbooks showed that an annual inspection had been completed on July 10, 2001.

The mechanics who performed services on N8WD in Houston, Texas before the accident did not release the airplane for flight.

METEOROLOGICAL INFORMATION

The Fulton County Airport, 2245, weather observation reported a scattered layer at 12000 feet, visibility 10 miles, winds calm.

AIRPORT INFORMATION

Fulton County Airport has two runways: 08/26 and 14/32. At the time of the accident, runway 08 was in use.

WRECKAGE AND IMPACT INFORMATION

Examination of the accident site disclosed that wreckage debris was scattered over an area approximately 450 feet long and 75 feet wide. The wreckage path was oriented on a 070 degree magnetic heading, and the airplane was oriented on a 165 degree magnetic heading. The airplane wreckage came to rest on a small grass island between the parking lot of a commercial business and the public service street in an industrial park. Several pieces of the airframe and the left wing assembly rested on the ground beneath a wide swath in the tree line 375 feet west of the main wreckage. Both fuel tanks were ruptured, but there was no visual observance or smell of fuel reported at the accident site. About three ounces of fuel were recovered from the fuel system of the airplane.

The subsequent examination of both engines failed to disclose a mechanical malfunction or component failure. The examination of the airframe subsystems also failed to reveal a mechanical failure.

MEDICAL AND PATHOLOGICAL INFORMATION

Postmortem examination of the pilot was performed by Dr. Frist at the office of the Cobb County Medical Examiner in Marietta, Georgia. The forensic toxicology was performed by the FAA Toxicology and Accident Research Laboratory, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The tests were negative for carbon monoxide, cyanide, drugs and alcohol.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

The airplane wreckage was released on 06/08/01, 2000 to Mr. John Marlowe, an insurance adjuster, Concord, North Carolina.

On a previous flight, prior to this accident, the pilot arrived at Houston Hobby Airport in Houston, Texas, experienced a complete loss of engine power. On July 30, 2000 the pilot landed at Houston Hobby Airport and stated he flew approximately 100 miles on one engine, and upon landing the second engine failed. The pilot was able to get both engines running and taxied the airplane to the Raytheon ramp. Reportedly, the airplane was refuel and the pilot experienced no further operational problems.

Again, the pilot arrived at Houston Hobby Airport on August 11, 2000 stating that at one time or another both engines had quit. Maintenance test ran the airplane and suggested that both engines fuel servos be checked. Fuel servos from both engines were sent for evaluation. The left engine fuel servo operated normally and the right engine fuel servo ran rich at low speeds.

Page 4 of 7 ATL00FA082

The mechanics did not sign off and return the airplane to service, because the maintenance service had not been completed. However, the pilot decided to depart Houston Hobby Airport and return to Peachtree-Dekalb Airport in Chamblee, Georgia.

During the examination of the wreckage, the airplane's over-wing emergency exit window was evaluated for operational ability. The emergency exit's briefing card instructions and required placards were also examined. The emergency exit window could not be removed in accordance with the airplane's briefing card and cabin window emergency placard instructions. When the airplane's right forward rear facing passenger seat was positioned in its most forward position, the emergency window's red "unlock" handle could barely be pulled down into the "unlocked" position.

Further examination and evaluation of the emergency exit window revealed that for the emergency exit window to be removed from its location within the fuselage, the cabin's right forward rear facing passenger seat must be fully folded over for the emergency exit to be "pulled in" to the fuselage.

The airplane's instructional placards and the airplane's passenger briefing card do not state that the affected passenger seat back must be folded over so the window emergency exit can be removed.

Currently, the airplane manufacturer, Raytheon Aircraft Company, has released a Service Bulletin, number 11-3404, which will revise the passenger briefing card to include the instructions to "fold the passenger seat back down," and revise the interior placard to include that the affected passenger seat back must be folded down to remove the emergency exit window. The Service Bulletin will apply to Models 58P, 60, B60, and 65-88. The passenger briefing card is not a FAR Part 23 or Part 91 requirement for the Beech Duke airplane.

The examination of the airplane also revealed that shoulder harness restraint systems were not installed at the pilot and right front seat positions.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	39, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalw/waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	03/14/2000
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	1800 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

Page 5 of 7 ATL00FA082

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N8WD
Model/Series:	B60 B60	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	P-258
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	07/10/2000, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	6775 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	24 Hours	Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2665 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	TIO-541-E1C4
Registered Owner:	XJ6 INC.	Rated Power:	310 hp
Operator:	MOHAMMAD W. KATOOT	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Night/Dark
Observation Facility, Elevation:	FTY, 831 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	1 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	2245 EDT	Direction from Accident Site:	80°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 12000 ft agl	Visibility	10 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None / 0 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	0 ft
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	84°C / 67°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	HOUSTON, TX (HOU)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	CHAMBLEE, GA (PDK)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	1830 CDT	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:	FULTON COUNTY AIRPORT (FTY)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	841 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	8	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5796 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced Landing

Page 6 of 7 ATL00FA082

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	On-Ground
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Fatal	Latitude, Longitude:	

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	PHILLIP POWELL	Report Date:	12/04/2001
Additional Participating Persons:	GLENN WHITE; COLLEGE PARK, GA		
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at publing@ntsb.gov , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at http://dms.ntsb.gov/pubdms/ .		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available here.

Page 7 of 7 ATL00FA082