

National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location: NORTH BRANCH, MN Accident Number: CHI93FA180

Date & Time: 05/22/1993, 1300 CDT Registration: N67E

Aircraft: BEECH C-18S Aircraft Damage: Destroyed

Defining Event: Injuries: 1 Fatal, 1 Serious

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Personal

Analysis

THE FLIGHT ORIGINATED AT 1235. THE PILOT PERFORMED TWO FLY-BY PASSES FOR THE DEDICATION OF A NEARBY MALL. THE PILOT RADIOED FOR CLEARANCE TO LAND AT THE PRIVATE AIRPORT WHICH HE OWNED. HE WAS GIVEN CLEARANCE TO LAND AND TOLD THE WIND WAS FROM THE SOUTH AT 20 KTS. THE PILOT LANDED ON RUNWAY 09. DURING LANDING ROLL, THE AIRPLANE WAS SEEN TO NOSE OVER. THE COCKPIT, CABIN, AND LEFT WING OF THE AIRPLANE WERE CONSUMED BY FIRE. THE PASSENGER ESCAPED THROUGH THE OVER-WING EMERGENCY EXIT ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE CABIN. HE STATED THE PILOT WAS LYING NEAR THE REAR DOOR AND WOULD NOT RESPOND TO STIMULUS. THE INVESTIGATION REVEALED TWO SKID MARKS IN THE GRASS WHICH TERMINATED AT THE AIRPLANE WRECKAGE. THE MARK MADE BY THE RIGHT MAIN LANDING GEAR WAS 750 FEET LONG. THE SKID MARK MADE BY THE LEFT MAIN LANDING GEAR WAS 560 FEET LONG.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: excessive use of brakes by the pilot-in-command.

Findings

Occurrence #1: NOSE OVER

Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

1. WEATHER CONDITION - CROSSWIND

2. (C) BRAKES(NORMAL) - EXCESSIVE - PILOT IN COMMAND

Factual Information

HISTORY OF THE FLIGHT

On May 22, 1993, at 1300 central daylight time, a Beech C-18S, N67E, nosed-over and burned during the landing rollout at Scott's Due North Airport, North Branch, Minnesota. The airplane was destroyed. The commercial pilot was fatally injured, and the sole passenger aboard the airplane was seriously injured. The local flight originated at the airport at 1235. No flight plan was filed, and visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time.

A witness who was working at the airport said the pilot did two fly-by passes for the dedication of a nearby shopping mall at 1250. At 1300 the pilot requested clearance to land. The witness told the pilot he was cleared to land, and that the wind was out of the south at 20 knots. The witness said the plane touched down fine, and five seconds into the landing roll it flipped over. He stated he called for emergency help, and then ran to the airplane. The passenger was out of the airplane. The airplane was engulfed in flames before he could assist the pilot.

The passenger was interviewed by telephone. He stated it was really windy that day, and that the pilot was having trouble controlling the airplane during landing. During the landing roll he stated the pilot said, "we're going over." After the airplane nosed over, the passenger said the pilot got out of his seat right away and said he was going back to open the door. The passenger stated he had some trouble getting his seatbelt undone.

When he extricated himself from his seat, he said it was really smoky, and a fire had started on the left side of the airplane. He went to the back of the airplane and said he found the pilot lying next to the door. He said he shook the pilot, but he did not respond. He said he egressed the airplane by knocking out the emergency exit on the right side, and crawling out.

PERSONNEL INFORMATION

The pilot held a commercial pilot's certificate with airplane, single and multiengine land and sea ratings. He held an instrument rating, and was a flight instructor. He held a second class medical certificate with the limitation that he wear glasses when flying. From information provided by persons who knew the pilot, and from the flight time declarations the pilot made on documents contained in his permanent airman file, it is estimated the pilot had 4000 hours total time, and 500 hours in this airplane.

AIRCRAFT INFORMATION

The airplane was manufactured in 1944, as a model C-18S. The airplane currently had a U.S. Navy SNB-1 paint scheme, but the permanent registration file showed the airplane was never used by any military force. The last inspection performed was an annual inspection on August 21, 1994. At that time the total airframe hours were 3805. The total time on the left and right engine respectively, at the time of the annual inspection was 1309 hours and 1286 hours. The time flown since the last inspection could not be determined.

METEOROLOGICAL INFORMATION

The wind at the airport was reported by several persons to be from the south at 20 knots. The closest reporting weather facility is the Minneapolis-St. Paul International Airport. The record observation taken at 1250 recorded the wind from 180 degrees at 16 knots gusting to 22 knots.

WRECKAGE

Page 2 of 5 CHI93FA180

The airplane was lying inverted on the northern half of runway 09. The cockpit, cabin, and most of the left wing had been destroyed by fire. On the grass runway there were skid marks 750 feet long on the right side of the ground track, and 560 feet long on the left side of the ground track. The right track begins 1000 feet from the landing threshold of runway 09. Where the skid marks stop there are seven pairs of parallel prop marks.

From the point where the prop marks stop there is a ground scar starting at the midpoint between the prop marks and terminating at the nose of the airplane.

The landing gear was down, and the flaps were in the full down position. Control continuity was established from the cockpit control pedestal to the ailerons, elevator, and both rudders. The left motor mount was broken and melted, and the engine was separated from the firewall. Both propellers have multiple bends and twists, and chordwise scratches on the blades. The throttle quadrant, and all the cockpit instrumentation was destroyed. The right side emergency escape window was lying on the ground under the right wing.

MEDICAL AND PATHOLOGICAL INFORMATION

An autopsy and toxicological examination of the pilot was conducted. The autopsy was performed on May 23, 1993, at the Regina Medical Complex, Hastings, Minnesota, by John Plunkett, M.D. The cause of death was reported as smoke inhalation and carbon monoxidemia. The toxicological examination showed the carboxyhemoglobin saturation in the blood to be 58%, and cyanide was detected in the blood at a level of 1.1 mg/L.

ADDITIONAL DATA

The wreckage was released to Mr. Don Fergus, as agent for the owner, on May 23, 1993.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Flight Instructor; Commercial	Age:	48, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Multi-engine Sea; Single-engine Land; Single- engine Sea	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane Multi-engine; Airplane Single-engine; Instrument Airplane	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medicalw/waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	07/11/1991
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	4000 hours (Total, all aircraft), 500	hours (Total, this make and model)	

Page 3 of 5 CHI93FA180

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	BEECH	Registration:	N67E
Model/Series:	C-18S C-18S	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Provisional; Normal	Serial Number:	6252
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tailwheel	Seats:	8
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	08/21/1992, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	8750 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	P&W
ELT:	Not installed	Engine Model/Series:	R-985-14B
Registered Owner:	DAVID L. SCOTT	Rated Power:	450 hp
Operator:	DAVID L. SCOTT	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	MSP, 487 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	35 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1250 CDT	Direction from Accident Site:	10°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 6000 ft agl	Visibility	15 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 7500 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	0 ft
Wind Speed/Gusts:	16 knots / 22 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	180°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	21°C / 9°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	(MY90)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(MY90)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	1235 CST	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	SCOTT'S DUE NORTH AIRPORT (MY90)	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:	950 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	9	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	3400 ft / 90 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full Stop; Straight-in

Page 4 of 5 CHI93FA180

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Passenger Injuries:	1 Serious	Aircraft Fire:	On-Ground
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Fatal, 1 Serious	Latitude, Longitude:	

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	MARK	E DOUB,	Report Date:	08/17/1994
Additional Participating Persons:	RICHARD	E WINLAND; MINNEAPOLIS, MN		
Publish Date:				
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at publinq@ntsb.gov , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at http://dms.ntsb.gov/pubdms/ .			

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available here.

Page 5 of 5 CHI93FA180