



# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	CARP LAKE, MI	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CHI86MA047
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	12/14/1985, 1538 EST	<b>Registration:</b>	N24RT
<b>Aircraft:</b>	BEECH B-60	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Destroyed
<b>Defining Event:</b>		<b>Injuries:</b>	5 Fatal
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General Aviation - Personal		

---

## Analysis

DRG ARRIVAL, THE PLT REPORTED A PROBLEM WITH HIS #1 NAV, BUT SAID HE WOULD TRY TO MAKE AN ILS APCH. HE SAID HE WOULD RETURN TO PONTIAC, IF HIS ILS DID NOT WORK. ARTCC CLEARED HIM FOR THE ILS RWY 32 APCH & INSTRUCTED HIM TO CONTACT PELLSTON RADIO (FSS). AT 1525, HE CALLED THE FSS & REPORTED HE WAS 20 MI SOUTH. AT APRX 1534, THE FSS SPECIALIST HEARD AN ACFT FLY OVER, BUT DID NOT KNOW IF IT WAS N24RT. HE ASKED THE PLT IF HE WAS MAKING A MISSED APCH. THE PLT GAVE A NEGATIVE REPLY & REPORTED HE WAS PICKING UP THE GLIDE SLOPE, THEN SAID HE WAS HAVING TROUBLE WITH HIS #1 NAV. A WITNESS ABOUT 6 MI NORTH & WEST OF THE ARPT SAW THE ACFT ON A NORTHERLY HEADING AT ABOUT 200 FT AGL. ABOUT 1 MIN LATER, THE ACFT COLLIDED WITH TREES, CRASHED & BURNED APRX 8 MI FROM THE ARPT AT AN APRX ELEV OF 900 FT. THE ARPT ELEV WAS 720 FT. THE NAV EQUIPMENT WAS TOO BADLY DAMAGED DRG THE ACDNT TO BE TESTED. ACCORDING TO THE ACFT RADIO LOG, THE LAST VOR CHECK WAS ON 9/10/83. THE PLT HAD LOGGED 5.4 HRS OF INSTRUMENT TIME DRG THE PREV 6 MOS, BUT HAD NOT LOGGED ANY APCHS.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

## Findings

---

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: APPROACH

### Findings

1. (F) COMM/NAV EQUIPMENT - ERRATIC
2. (F) OPERATION WITH KNOWN DEFICIENCIES IN EQUIPMENT - CONTINUED - PILOT IN COMMAND
3. (F) IN-FLIGHT PLANNING/DECISION - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND
4. (F) LACK OF RECENT INSTRUMENT TIME - PILOT IN COMMAND
5. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - LOW CEILING
6. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - SNOW
7. (C) IFR PROCEDURE - NOT FOLLOWED - PILOT IN COMMAND
8. (C) MISSED APPROACH - NOT PERFORMED - PILOT IN COMMAND
9. (F) OBJECT - TREE(S)

-----

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

## Factual Information

### Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	49, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Unknown
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	09/26/1985
Occupational Pilot:	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:		
Flight Time:	910 hours (Total, all aircraft), 9 hours (Total, this make and model), 11 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	BEECH	Registration:	N24RT
Model/Series:	B-60 B-60	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	P-329
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	10/18/1985, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	6775 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	16 Hours	Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2684 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:		Engine Model/Series:	TIO-541-E1C4
Registered Owner:		Rated Power:	380 hp
Operator:	COMMANDER CHARTER, INC.	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Instrument Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	PLN, 720 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	8 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1545 EST	Direction from Accident Site:	160°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Partial Obscuration / 0 ft agl	Visibility	1 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 2000 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	0 ft
Wind Speed/Gusts:	13 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	260°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	-9° C / -12° C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	PONTIAC, MI (PIK)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	PELLSTON, MI (PLN)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	1416 EST	Type of Airspace:	Airport Advisory Area

## Airport Information

Airport:	EMMET COUNTY (PLN)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	720 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	
Runway Used:	32	IFR Approach:	ILS
Runway Length/Width:	6512 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	None

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Passenger Injuries:	4 Fatal	Aircraft Fire:	On-Ground
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	5 Fatal	Latitude, Longitude:	

## Administrative Information

<b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>	FRED A RATHKE	<b>Report Date:</b>
<b>Additional Participating Persons:</b>	R. NAVARRO; GRAND RAPIDS, MI M. J ZUPAN; GRAND RAPIDS, MI R. J MCELROY; GRAND RAPIDS, MI J. STAAB; WICHITA, KS	
<b>Publish Date:</b>		
<b>Investigation Docket:</b>	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at <a href="mailto:pubinq@ntsb.gov">pubinq@ntsb.gov</a> , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at <a href="http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/">http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/</a> .	

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).