

National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location: Kahului, HI Accident Number: LAX04LA127

Date & Time: 02/18/2004, 1352 HST Registration: C-GPTE

Aircraft: Piper PA-31 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: Injuries: 1 Serious

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Ferry

Analysis

The airplane collided with terrain 200 yards short of the runway during an emergency landing following a loss of engine power. The pilot was on an intermediate leg of a ferry trip. Approximately 300 miles from land, the fuel flow and boost pump lights illuminated. Then, the right engine failed. The pilot flew back to the nearest airport; however, approximately 200 yards from the runway, the airplane stalled and the right wing dropped and collided with the ground. The fuel system had been modified a few months prior to the accident to allow for a ferry fuel tank installation. Post accident examination of the airplane could not find a reason for the power loss.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot's failure to maintain an adequate airspeed while maneuvering for landing on one engine, which resulted in an inadvertent stall. The loss of power in one engine for undetermined reasons was a factor.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER

Phase of Operation: CRUISE

Findings

1. (F) 1 ENGINE

2. REASON FOR OCCURRENCE UNDETERMINED

Occurrence #2: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT

Phase of Operation: APPROACH - VFR PATTERN - FINAL APPROACH

Findings

3. (C) AIRSPEED - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND

4. (C) STALL - INADVERTENT - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Findings

5. TERRAIN CONDITION - GROUND

Page 2 of 6 LAX04LA127

Factual Information

On February 18, 2004, at 1352 Hawaiian standard time, a Canadian registered Piper PA 31, C-GPTE, landed short of the runway at the Kahului Airport, Maui, Hawaii, during an emergency landing following a loss of engine power. Computaplane, Ltd., was operating the airplane under the provisions of 14 CFR Part 91. The pilot, who held commercial pilot certificates issued by Canada and the United States, sustained serious injuries; the airplane sustained substantial damage. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the cross-country positioning flight that departed from Honolulu International Airport, Honolulu, Hawaii, about 0700, en route to Oakland, California. An instrument flight rules (IFR) flight plan had been filed.

The Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector reported that the pilot was ferrying the airplane. Approximately 300 miles east of Honolulu, the pilot reported that the right engine failed. The pilot diverted to Kahului; however, the airplane landed short of the runway. The inspector conducted a post impact examination but could not determine why the power loss occurred.

According to the owner of the airplane, Murray's Aircraft Service, the pilot was hired through Computaplane, a ferry company based in Scotland. Murray's Aircraft Service completed a modification of the fuel system on November 25, 2003, to allow for additional fuel onboard the airplane during flight. The airplane was being returned to Canada from Australia; the pilot was on the intermediate leg of the trip when the accident occurred.

The operator stated that they believed the accident resulted from the pilot failing to identify the stall warnings during the last portion of the flight, and his failure to recognize and recover from the final stall, just prior to the airplane's impact with the ground.

The pilot provided a written statement of the circumstances surrounding the accident. The airplane had various repairs from the time the pilot ferried the airplane from Brooks, Alberta, Canada, to deliver it to Australia, and then back again. His departure from Honolulu was uneventful until the low fuel flow and boost pump lights illuminated. He stabilized the airplane for single engine operations and transmitted a "MAYDAY" call. About 30 minutes from Maui, the controller advised the pilot that he was closer to Maui than Honolulu. About 40 miles from Maui, the airplane's controls began to chatter "like they were slipping." Approximately 200 yards from the runway, the controls "chattered hard and then the right wing dropped and I hit the ground hard." He recalled the owners mentioning that the fuel pumps had not been replaced, but they decided not to replace them.

Page 3 of 6 LAX04LA127

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial; Foreign	Age:	42, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	01/12/2004
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:			

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	C-GPTE
Model/Series:	PA-31	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	31-7712059
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	1
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	11/25/2003, AAIP	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	6880 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	7923.1 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:		Engine Model/Series:	TIO-540-F2BD
Registered Owner:	Quikway Air Services, Inc.	Rated Power:	325 hp
Operator:	Computaplane	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Page 4 of 6 LAX04LA127

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KOGG, 54 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	1352 HST	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 3900 ft agl	Visibility	10 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	6 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	1
Wind Direction:	Variable	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.07 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	28°C / 19°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Honolulu, HI (HNL)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	Oakland, CA (OAK)	Type of Clearance:	VFR
Departure Time:	0700 HST	Type of Airspace:	Class D

Airport Information

Airport:	Kahului (OGG)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	54 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	20	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	7000 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Precautionary Landing; Straight-in

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious	Latitude, Longitude:	20.898611, -156.430556

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	George Petterson	Report Date:	06/08/2005
Additional Participating Persons:	Michael Spencer; Federal Aviation Administ	ration; Honolulu, HI	
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at publing@ntsb.gov , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at http://dms.ntsb.gov/pubdms/ .		

Page 5 of 6 LAX04LA127

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 LAX04LA127