

# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location: Clovis, NM Accident Number: CEN15LA354

Date & Time: 08/09/2015, 0925 MDT Registration: N726JB

Aircraft: CESSNA C421B Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** Fuel starvation Injuries: 1 Serious

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Personal

### **Analysis**

The private pilot reported that he was approaching the airport for landing in the multi-engine airplane when both engines began to surge. The pilot attempted to switch to the auxiliary fuel tanks, but inadvertently switched the left engine fuel selector to the off position. The left engine subsequently experienced a total loss of engine power. On final approach for landing, the airplane impacted terrain and was subsequently consumed by a postimpact fire; the fuel onboard the airplane at the time of the accident could not be determined. An examination of the airplane's engines and systems revealed no mechanical anomalies that would have precluded normal operation.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot's improper management of fuel to the left engine during approach for landing, which resulted in a total loss of left engine power due to fuel starvation, and his subsequent failure to maintain control during the final landing approach, which resulted in collision with terrain.

#### **Findings**

| Aircraft         | Fuel - Fluid management (Cause)              |  |
|------------------|--|--|
| Personnel issues | Incorrect action performance - Pilot (Cause) |  |
|                  | Aircraft control - Pilot (Cause)             |  |

#### **Factual Information**

On August 9, 2015, at 0925 mountain daylight time, a Cessna 421B, N726JB, impacted terrain following a loss of left engine power during final approach for landing on runway 12 at Clovis Municipal Airport (CVN), Clovis, New Mexico. The pilot received serious injuries and the airplane sustained substantial damage. The airplane was registered to and operated by the pilot under 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91 personal flight that was not operating on a flight plan. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of accident. The flight originated from a private airstrip near Melrose, New Mexico, and was destined to CVN.

A completed National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident/Incident Report Form 6120.1 was not received from the pilot, as required by Part 830.5, by either the NTSB Investigator-In-Charge or Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) Coordinator for the accident.

Witness stated that they heard the airplane engines "popping" as it approached and entered the traffic pattern. The airplane left wing contacted terrain short of runway 12 and the airplane cartwheeled. A post-impact fire occurred and the wings and fuselage were severely damaged.

The pilot provided a limited statement to the FAA Coordinator, in which he stated he had ample fuel for the short flight from a private ranch in Melrose, New Mexico to CVN (30 miles to the east), when both engines began to surge. The pilot stated he attempted to switch both tanks to Auxiliary but inadvertently switched the left fuel selector to Off. The left engine experienced a total loss of engine power. The pilot said he was too high to land on runway 22 and attempted to land on runway 12. However, the airplane impacted terrain approximately 1,000 feet southeast of the runway 12/22 intersection between runway 12 and the parallel taxiway. The aircraft was traveling southeast attempting to land on runway 12 before losing control.

An examination of the wreckage was conducted by an FAA inspector and the total amount of fuel onboard the airplane at the time of the accident could not be determined due to post impact damage and fire. No anomalies were noted with the airframe or engines that would have precluded normal operation.

#### History of Flight

| Approach                   | Fuel starvation (Defining event)   |
|----------------------------|------------------------------------|
|                            | Loss of engine power (total)       |
| Approach-VFR pattern final | Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT) |

Page 2 of 5 CEN15LA354

### **Pilot Information**

| Certificate:              | Private   | Age:                                  | 65, Male               |
|---------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|------------------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Multi-engine Land; Single-engine<br>Land            | Seat Occupied:                        | Left                   |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None  | Restraint Used:                       |                        |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | None  | Second Pilot Present:                 | No                     |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None  | Toxicology Performed:                 | No                     |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3 With Waivers/Limitations                    | Last FAA Medical Exam:                | 02/11/2015             |
| Occupational Pilot:       | No  | Last Flight Review or Equivalent:     |                        |
| Flight Time:              | 3700 hours (Total, all aircraft), 300 all aircraft) | hours (Total, this make and model), 2 | 0 hours (Last 90 days, |

# Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make:                | CESSNA             | Registration:                     | N726JB          |
|-------------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                 | C421B              | Aircraft Category:                | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:          | 1970               | Amateur Built:                    | No              |
| Airworthiness Certificate:    | Normal             | Serial Number:                    | 421B0020        |
| Landing Gear Type:            | Tricycle           | Seats:                            |                 |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | 07/22/2015, Annual | Certified Max Gross Wt.:          | 7250 lbs        |
| Time Since Last Inspection:   |                    | Engines:                          | 2 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:          |                    | Engine Manufacturer:              | Continental     |
| ELT:                          |                    | Engine Model/Series:              | GTSIO-520-H     |
| Registered Owner:             | Pilot              | Rated Power:                      | 375 hp          |
| Operator:                     | Pilot              | Operating Certificate(s)<br>Held: | None            |
|                               |                    |                                   |                 |

Page 3 of 5 CEN15LA354

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:     | Visual Conditions   | Condition of Light:                  | Day              |
|----------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | CVN, 4216 ft msl    | Distance from Accident Site:         | 0 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time:                | 0915 MDT            | Direction from Accident Site:        |                  |
| Lowest Cloud Condition:          | Clear               | Visibility                           | 10 Miles         |
| Lowest Ceiling:                  | None                | Visibility (RVR):                    |                  |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                | 14 knots / 19 knots | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:  | /                |
| Wind Direction:                  | 250°                | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | /                |
| Altimeter Setting:               | 30.1 inches Hg      | Temperature/Dew Point:               | 27°C / 16°C      |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:   |                     |                                      |                  |
| Departure Point:                 | Melrose, NM (PVT)   | Type of Flight Plan Filed:           | None             |
| Destination:                     | Clovis, NM (CVN)    | Type of Clearance:                   | None             |
| Departure Time:                  | 0825 MDT            | Type of Airspace:                    |                  |
|                                  |                     |                                      |                  |

### **Airport Information**

| Airport:             | Clovis Municipal Airport (CVN) | Runway Surface Type:      | Asphalt                    |
|----------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|
| Airport Elevation:   | 4216 ft                        | Runway Surface Condition: | Unknown                    |
| Runway Used:         | 12                             | IFR Approach:             | None                       |
| Runway Length/Width: | 5697 ft / 150 ft               | VFR Approach/Landing:     | Full Stop; Traffic Pattern |

## Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:      | 1 Serious | Aircraft Damage:     | Substantial                  |
|---------------------|-----------|----------------------|------------------------------|
| Passenger Injuries: | N/A       | Aircraft Fire:       | On-Ground                    |
| Ground Injuries:    | N/A       | Aircraft Explosion:  | None                         |
| Total Injuries:     | 1 Serious | Latitude, Longitude: | 34.426667, -103.077500 (est) |

## Administrative Information

| Investigator In Charge (IIC):     | Mitchell F Gallo                              | Report Date:       | 03/19/2018  |
|-----------------------------------|---|--------------------|-------------|
| Additional Participating Persons: | Gordon Morris; Federal Aviation Administratio | n; Lubbock FSDO; I | Lubbock, TX |
| Publish Date:                     | 03/19/2018                                    |                    |             |
| Note:                             | The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this  | accident.          |             |
| Investigation Docket:             | http://dms.ntsb.gov/pubdms/search/dockl       | ist.cfm?mKey=917   | <u>768</u>  |

Page 4 of 5 CEN15LA354

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available here.

Page 5 of 5 CEN15LA354